Indiana Election Commission Minutes August 18, 2017

Members Present: Bryce H. Bennett, Jr., Chairman of the Indiana Election Commission ("Commission"); Karen Celestino-Horseman, Proxy for S. Anthony Long, Vice Chairman of the Commission; Zachary E. Klutz, member; Suzannah Wilson Overholt; Stephanie Beckley, Proxy for Bryce H. Bennett, Jr., Chairman.

Members Absent: S. Anthony Long, Vice-Chairman of the Commission.

Staff Attending: J. Bradley King, Co-Director of the Indiana Election Division of the Office of the Indiana Secretary of State (Election Division); Angela M. Nussmeyer, Co-Director of the Election Division; Matthew R. Kochevar, Co-General Counsel of the Election Division; Abbey Taylor, Campaign Finance Division staff; Michelle Thompson, Campaign Finance Division staff.

Others Attending: Dr. Jay Bagga and Dr. Bryan Byers, Voting System Technical Oversight Program (VSTOP); Mr. Dan Ball; Ms. Leslie Barnes; Mr. Philip Bennett; Mr. Dan Cruz; Mr. Evan Demaree; Mr. Robert Deppert; Mr. Daniel Douglass: Mr. William M. Ehret; Mr. Jeff Embry; Mr. Graham Fishell; Mr. Rick Gill; The Hon. Randy Head, Indiana State Senator; Ms. Lacy Hollings; Ms. Brenna McDonald; Mr. Bradford Moulton; Mr. Jeff Murray; Mr. Dale Nowlin; Mr. Matt Owen; Ms. Rebecca Phipps; Ms. Tracy Phillips; Mr. Andy Pickell; Mr. Ian Piper; Mr. Kevin Rogers; The Hon. John Ruckelshaus, Indiana State Representative; Mr. Roy Saenz; Mr. Michael Scott; Mr. James Shelton; Mr. Lawrence Shouse; Mr. Don Shuler; Mr. Farley Smith; Ms. Vicky Sorensen; Mr. Matthew Swentkofske; Ms. Danielle Taylor; The Hon. Greg Taylor, Indiana State Senator; Mr. Andy Talarzyk; Ms. Aurea Torres; Mr. Franklyn Voorhies; Mr. Scott Willis; Ms. Corinne Youngs; Mr. Shane Zoellner.

1. Call to Order:

The Chair called the August 18, 2017 meeting of the Commission to order at 1:33 p.m. EDT in the Indiana Government Center South Conference Center, Room B, 402 West Washington Street, Indianapolis, Indiana.

2. Transaction of Commission Business:

The Commission proceeded to transact the business set forth in the Transcript of Proceedings for this meeting prepared by Elizabeth Summers Long of Connor Reporting.

The Commission corrected the following scrivener's errors in this document:

Page 1, delete lines 9 through 9, and insert "2017, in the Indiana Government Center South Conference Center, Room B, 402 West Washington Street, Indianapolis, Indiana.

Page 6, line 11, replace "IEC11" with "IEC-11".

- Page 6, line 15, replace "SE861" with "SEA 61".
- Page 6, line 21, replace "IC11" with "IEC-11".
- Page 10, line 21, replace "refusal" with "recusal".
- Page 10, line 23, replace "refusal" with "recusal".
- Page 31, line 17, replace "NUSSMEYER" with "OVERHOLT".
- Page 39, line 5, replace "date" with "pay".
- Page 52, line 16, replace "MEMBER" with "CO-DIRECTOR".
- Page 52, line 16, replace "Abby" with "Abbey".
- Page 56, line 22, replace 'Barns' with "Barnes".
- Page 56, line 24, replace 'Barns' with "Barnes".
- Page 57, line 9, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".
- Page 57, line 12, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".
- Page 57, line 15, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".
- Page 58, line 5, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".
- Page 58, line 8, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".
- Page 58, line 11, replace '23-1-729" with "23-1-7-29".
- Page 59, line 17, replace 'Prazel" with "Frizzell".
- Page 60, line 18, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".
- Page 61, line 11, replace '352-37" with "3-5-2-37".
- Page 61, line 24, replace 'Razel" with "Frizzell".
- Page 62, line 2, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".
- Page 62, line 11, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".
- Page 62, line 16, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".

Page 62, line 23, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".

Page 63, line 6, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".

Page 63, line 12, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".

Page 63, line 16, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".

Page 63, line 24, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".

Page 64, line 20, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".

Page 64, line 22, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".

Page 65, line 2, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".

Page 65, line 4, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".

Page 65, line 13, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".

Page 65, line 24, replace 'BARNS" with "BARNES".

Page 73, line 19, replace "Politcal" with "Political".

Page 76, line 15, replace "sportmanships" with "sponsorships".

Page 97, line 11, delete "attorney".

Page 112, line 7, replace "the C" with "these".

Page 113, line 5, after "declaration" insert "of".

Page 127, line 6, replace "CFA11" with "CFA-11".

Page 130, line 12, replace "We" with "He".

Page 133, line 9, replace "Abby" with "Abbey".

Page 139, line 21, replace "plunder" with "blunder".

Page 153, line 16, replace "continuations" with "for continuance".

Page 156, line 3, replace "Abby" with "Abbey".

Page 157, line 5, replace "allow" with "not interfere".

Page 29, line 12, replace "IECA" with "IEC-8".

Page 29, line 13, replace "pay role" with "payroll".

Page 32, line 16, replace "instability" with "accessibility".

Page 35, line 21, replace "DERNULC" with "GABRIONE".

Page 38, line 17, replace "one" with "off".

Page 40, line 14, replace "2016" with "2017".

Page 41, line 9, after "Republican" insert "members of the".

Page 45, line 7, replace "336511210" with "IC 3-6-5.2-10".

Page 46, line 7, replace "3-11-1.54" with "3-11-1.5-4".

Page 48, line 1, replace "legislation" with "commission".

Page 51, line 8, replace "February" with "January".

Page 56, line 3, replace "CO-COUNSEL KOCHEVAR" with "CO-DIRECTOR KING".

This document is incorporated by reference into these minutes. The Commission adjourned this meeting at 3:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

J. Bradley King

Co-Director

Angela M. Nussmey

Co-Director

APPROVED:

Bryce H. Bennett, Jr.

Chairman



In the Matter Of:

INDIANA ELECTION COMMISSION HEARING

TRANSCRIPT OF HEARING August 18, 2017



CONNOR REPORTING

111 Monument Circle, Suite 4350 Indianapolis, IN 46204

Phone: 317-236-6022 Fax: 317-236-6015

Toll Free: 800-554-3376

Transcript of Hearing August 18, 2017

	August 18, 2017
1	
2	
3	BEFORE THE INDIANA ELECTION COMMISSION
4	
5	
6	
7	TRANSCRIPT OF HEARING
8	
9	Hearing held on the 18th day of August, 2017, in the offices of Indiana State House, 200
10	West Washington Street, Room 431, Indianapolis, Indiana.
11	
12	A STENOGRAPHIC RECORD
13	
14	By: Elizabeth Summers Long Notary Public
15	Stenographic Reporter
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
1	



	ragaet 10, 2011	
1		2
2	APPEARANCES	
3	INDIANA ELECTION COMMISSION:	
4	Bryce H. Bennett, Jr Chairman	
5	Karen Celestino-Horseman - Proxy Vice-Chairman	
6	Suzannah Wilson Overholt - Member	
7	Zachary E. Klutz - Member	
8	INDIANA ELECTION DIVISION STAFF:	
9	Bradley King - Co-Director	
10	Angela M. Nussmeyer - Co-Director	
11	Matthew R. Kochevar - Co-Legal Counsel	
12	ALSO PRESENT:	
13	Stephanie Beckley - Proxy Chairwoman	
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		=
23		
24		
25		
1		



1	
2	(Time Noted: 1:33 p.m.)
3	CHAIRMAN BENNETT: This meeting of the
4	Indiana Election Commission is called to order.
5	The following members of the commission are
6	present; myself, Chairman Bryce Bennett, our
7	vice-chairman Anthony Long is represented today
8	by proxy, Karen Horseman, and member, Suzannah
9	Wilson Overholt is with us today. Member
10	Zachary Klutz, and Stephanie Beckley is proxy
11	for me on certain campaign finance matters that
12	the commission will consider. Indiana Election
13	Division staff, co-director Brad King is not yet
14	with us, but will be soon, and co-director Angie
15	Nussmeyer. The co-general counsel are Matthew
16	Kochevar who is here, and Dale Simmons, who is
17	absent, taking a well-deserved vacation.
18	Our court reporter today is Elizabeth Long.
19	She has asked me to remind everyone that there
20	are no microphones here in this room. And
21	therefore we ask that you speak loudly and
22	clearly so the the court reporter can hear you
23	and take down your testimony.
24	And if my voice starts to fail, those who
25	can't hear me wave or raise your hand and I'll



- 1 see if I got anything left in the tank.
- 2 Before we begin I want to remind everyone
- 3 on behalf of the court reporter to identify
- 4 yourself when you're beginning to speak, spell
- 5 your name when identifying yourself, speak
- 6 clearly, and do not speak at the same time as
- 7 others.
- 8 And at this time I would request that the
- 9 co-directors confirm that the commission meeting
- 10 has been properly noticed as required by the
- 11 open door laws.
- 12 CO-DIRECTOR KING: Mr. Chairman and members
- 13 of the commission, this meeting has been
- 14 properly noticed by being posted under the open
- 15 door law. And I'll add that the members of the
- 16 Ball State Voting System Technical Oversight
- 17 Program are now present.
- 18 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Very good. The gang is
- 19 all here. Thank you. Very good.
- I now ask that everyone present who plans
- 21 to testify regarding any matter coming before
- 22 the commission today, if you would please stand
- 23 for the administration of the oath. I recognize
- 24 Mr. Kochevar to administer the oath.
- MR. KOCHEVAR: Please raise your right hand



1	and say I do after recitation of the oath.
2	Do you solemnly swear or affirm under the
3	penalties of perjury that the testimony you are
4	about to give to the Indiana Election Commission
5	is the truth, the whole truth and nothing but
6	the truth, say I do.
7	THE WITNESSES: I do.
8	CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Our first order of
9	business is the presentation by VSTOP concerning
10	Dominion Voting System's application for
11	recertification of current voting system. I now
12	recognize Dr. Jay Bagga and Dr. Brian Byers, of
13	Ball State University, which administers the
14	Voting System Technical Oversight Program, for a
15	presentation concerning those that voting
16	system. At the August 8th meeting, the
17	commission approved the Dominion Voting System
18	report from Pro V&V laboratories, and Dominion
19	Voting System's implementation plan to permit
20	recertification of its current system by the
21	commission.
22	The binders for today's meeting include a



23

24

report from VSTOP and information regarding

Dominion's compliance with the implementation

plan and VSTOP's recommendations regarding the

- 1 recertification of the Dominion Voting GEMS
- 2 1.18.24D1 system.
- I would now ask for the VSTOP presentation.
- 4 DR. BAGGA: Thank you. Mr. Chairman and
- 5 members of the commission. My name is Jay
- 6 Bagga, J-A-Y, B-A-G-G-A. I'm a co-director of
- 7 VSTOP, and with me is Dr. Bryan Byers,
- 8 B-R-Y-A-N, B-Y-E-R-S, co-director of VSTOP.
- 9 We wish to present our report on Dominion
- 10 Voting System. Dominion Voting System submitted
- 11 the IEC11 application, which is in Appendix E of
- 12 your report, along with all of the supporting
- 13 documentation for previously approved system
- 14 GEMS 1.8.2014. This system was modified to
- 15 accommodate SE861 changes. The IEC approved
- 16 this modification and this modification was
- 17 implemented in 18 Dominion counties between
- 18 August 9th and August 17th. Please see Appendix
- 19 C for the implementation report of Dominion's
- 20 implementation in the 18 counties.
- VSTOP has reviewed the IC11 application.
- 22 Also the supporting documentation and
- 23 attestation from Dominion, which is included in
- 24 your Appendix D, that the system is identical to
- 25 the systems certified except for the SEA61



- 7
- 1 modification, which has been approved by the
- 2 commission.
- We also have evidence that Dominion has
- 4 escrowed the software to the third party,
- 5 escrowed, approved by the State of Indiana.
- 6 VSTOP finds that this system meets all the
- 7 requirements of the Indiana Code for the use in
- 8 the State of Indiana, and as stated in the
- 9 attached attestation, is identical to what the
- 10 election approved earlier by the Indiana
- 11 Election Commission except for the modification.
- 12 And VSTOP recommends the renewal of the
- application for GEMS 1.18.24D1.0.
- 14 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Thank you. Is there a
- 15 representative of Dominion or other persons
- 16 present who wishes to testify regarding this
- 17 matter?
- 18 MR. PIPER: Ian Piper, I-A-N, P-I-P-E-R,
- 19 with Dominion Voting. I have nothing further to
- 20 say at this time.
- 21 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Thank you. Are there
- 22 any questions or discussion from commission
- 23 members?
- Is there a motion to adopt findings that
- the Dominion Voting System GEMS 1.18.24D1.0



- 1 voting system complies with the standards
- 2 prescribed for voting systems under the Indiana
- 3 law, has worked effectively where the system has
- 4 been used, and has been adequately supported by
- 5 the vendor, and therefore, to recertify this
- 6 voting system for marketing, sale, lease,
- 7 installation, and implementation in Indiana for
- 8 a the four-year term beginning October 1, 2017.
- 9 MEMBER KLUTZ: So moved.
- 10 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: We have a motion. Is
- 11 there a second?
- MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: Second.
- 13 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Motion and a second.
- 14 Any discussion? All in favor say aye?
- 15 MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT: Aye.
- 16 MEMBER KLUTZ: Aye.
- MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: Aye.
- 18 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: All opposed say nay.
- 19 The ayes have it. The motion it adopted. Thank
- 20 you very much.
- DR. BAGGA: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
- DR. BYERS: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
- 23 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Thank you for all your
- 24 attention to this issue.
- We now turn to ratification of any finance



- 1 settlement agreements and I ask for a
- 2 presentation by Ms. Taylor and Ms. Thompson in
- 3 front of the commission.
- 4 MS. THOMPSON: We're ready to take this
- 5 forward.
- 6 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Okay. Very well. After
- 7 that -- I have designated Stephanie Beckley to
- 8 act as my proxy for consideration in voting on
- 9 one of these agreements. Before she takes the
- 10 gavel, is there a motion to ratify the campaign
- 11 finance settlement agreements as presented with
- 12 the exception of the Steve Carter committee
- 13 matter.
- 14 MEMBER KLUTZ: So moved.
- 15 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Is there a second?
- 16 Any discussion?
- 17 MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT: Did you have a
- 18 second?
- 19 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: We have a motion and a
- 20 second -- did we have a second?
- 21 MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT: I don't think we
- 22 did. I'll second.
- 23 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Okay. A motion and a
- 24 second.
- 25 Any discussion?



- 1 Hearing none, all in favor say aye.
- 2 MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT: Aye.
- 3 MEMBER KLUTZ: Aye.
- 4 MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: Aye.
- 5 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Ayes have it.
- 6 We have -- the motion to ratify the
- 7 agreements is adopted.
- 8 At this time I will ask Stephanie to assume
- 9 the chair.
- 10 MS. BECKLEY: Is there a motion to ratify
- 11 the campaign finance settlement concerning
- 12 the --
- 13 MEMBER KLUTZ: Can we clarify what's on
- 14 your settlement list?
- MS. THOMPSON: Yes, Mr. Chairman and
- 16 members, it's on the green tab.
- 17 COURT REPORTER: Ma'am, I'm sorry. What's
- 18 your name?
- MS. THOMPSON: Michelle Thompson.
- 20 MEMBER KLUTZ: This is the settlement
- 21 agreement based upon the refusal or --
- MS. THOMPSON: I don't understand --
- MS. TAYLOR: We don't know what the refusal
- 24 was for.
- 25 MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT: What we just



- 1 approved were the ones -- the settlement
- 2 agreements on the green tab as well.
- 3 MS. THOMPSON: Right.
- 4 MEMBER KLUTZ: Modify the next --
- 5 MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: Steve Carter would
- 6 have been -- what happened to Steve Carter? Is
- 7 there an enforcement action for Steve Carter?
- 8 MS. THOMPSON: I don't know. I don't know.
- 9 MS. BECKLEY: All right. So I want to note
- 10 that no further commission action is necessary
- 11 at this time, and I will yield the chair back to
- 12 Chairman Bennett.
- 13 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: We will now turn our
- 14 attention to campaign finance referrals to the
- 15 attorney general for collection. I understand
- 16 there are referrals of the committee's to the
- 17 attorney general for collection of the
- 18 following, and that campaign finances staff can
- 19 provide information regarding those referrals.
- 20 And ask that --
- MS. THOMPSON: Yes, Mr. Chairman, under
- 22 your red tab are two separate lists of
- 23 committees that have not paid the fines, and our
- 24 recommendation is to turn them over to the
- 25 attorney general.



1	CHAIRMAN BENNETT: I note that is there
2	anything further in your presentation?
3	MS. THOMPSON: No.
4	CHAIRMAN BENNETT: I note that no further
5	commission action is necessary for those
6	referrals to be made.
7	So we will turn our attention to the
8	opportunity for committees, or committees with
9	representatives, present today to accept a
10	reduced penalty. Before proceeding with the
11	campaign finance enforcement actions, we want to
12	give any committee present here today a final
13	opportunity to pay a reduced civil penalty by
14	waiving the right to present evidence and
15	arguments to the commission.
16	Any committee is welcome to present
17	evidence and arguments for the proposed penalty
18	to be waived.
19	This is an opportunity for those who want
20	to waive that presentation and accept a reduced
21	penalty without making any arguments or
22	presentations.
23	I move for the following arrangements to be
24	adopted. If this is the committee's first
25	violation, the arrangement is for the committee

		13
1	to agree to pay 25 percent of the proposed fine	13
2	plus mailing costs.	
3	If this the committee's second violation,	
4	the arrangement is for the committee to agree to	
5	pay 50 percent of the proposed fine plus mailing	
6	costs.	
7	If this the committee's third violation,	
8	the committee would agree to pay 75 percent of	
9	the proposed violation plus mailing cost.	
10	Is there a second to this motion?	
11	MEMBER KLUTZ: Second.	
12	CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Any discussion?	
13	There is no discussion.	
14	All in favor say aye.	
15	MEMBER KLUTZ: Aye.	
16	MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: Aye.	
17	MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT: Aye.	
18	CHAIRMAN BENNETT: All opposed say nay.	
19	The ayes have it, and the motion is	
20	adopted.	
21	Are there any committees who want to accept	
22	this arrangement?	
23	Yes, sir, in the front row.	
24	LAWRENCE SHOUSE: Lawrence Shouse with the	
25	Hunter District IA-W-R-E-N-C-F S-H-O-II-S-F	



1 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: And cause number? 2 you have your cause number? 3 LAWRENCE SHOUSE: No, I didn't bring it. CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Give us a minute, sir, 5 so we can get the cause number. 6 MS. THOMPSON: Chairman, that's on page 38 7 of the spreadsheet. It's Lawrence B. Shouse for State Representative 100, Cause Number 9 2017-6773-59. Has never been before the commission before, and has a civil penalty of 10 11 \$150.47. 12 LAWRENCE SHOUSE: I was three days off the 13 mark. 14 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are you willing to 15 accept the 25 percent penalty? 16 LAWRENCE SHOUSE: Absolutely. 17 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: If you can hang on one 18 moment -- the arrangement is accepted. You're 19 free to go. Thank you very much. LAWRENCE SHOUSE: Who do I mail the --20 21 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: You will be receiving an 22 invoice in the mail for the 25 percent. 23 take a little bit of time to get through the 24 system, but you'll get that. 25 AUREA TORRES: Good afternoon, sorry, this

- 1 is my first time. I'm here to answer for these
- 2 -- to this hearing for these cause numbers. I
- 3 have them, if you want me to read them if that's
- 4 easier for you --
- 5 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Yes.
- 6 AUREA TORRES: -- or I could just give you
- 7 the --
- 8 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are there several cause
- 9 numbers?
- 10 AUREA TORRES: There's three, I believe.
- 11 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Go ahead and read them
- 12 into the record.
- 13 AUREA TORRES: Okay. Administrative cause
- 14 number 2017-6923-4. Administrative cause
- 15 2017-6923-148. And Administrative cause number
- 16 2017-6923-117.
- 17 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: And your name?
- AUREA TORRES: My name is Aurea Torres. My
- 19 committee was Torres for State Representative
- 20 Committee. I ran for a state office, much to my
- 21 regret at this point. I came from La Porte,
- 22 Indiana, to answer for this. I know that you
- 23 motioned that we pay 25 percent, I believe the
- 24 fine for these is \$250.00 or \$200.00. I'm not
- 25 even sure.



		40
1	CHAIRMAN BENNETT: What is the fine on	16
2	these?	
3	MS. TAYLOR: We	
4	CHAIRMAN BENNETT: We're talking about the	
5	first cause number?	
6	AUREA TORRES: Any of them. Because	
7	basically, I'm a single mom. I ran for office.	
8	My campaign only	
9	CHAIRMAN BENNETT: You don't have to make	
10	any argument.	
11	AUREA TORRES: Oh, okay.	
12	CHAIRMAN BENNETT: We're just trying to	
13	find the right	
14	AUREA TORRES: The percentages, yeah. I	
15	think I collected \$450.00 total. So I think	
16	MS. THOMPSON: \$1,400.00.	
17	CHAIRMAN BENNETT: For all three?	
18	MS. THOMPSON: Yes.	
19	MS. TAYLOR: Yes.	
20	CHAIRMAN BENNETT: That's the 25 percent?	
21	MS. THOMPSON: That's her total fine. It	
22	would be 25 percent	
23	CHAIRMAN BENNETT: 25 percent of that?	
24	MS. THOMPSON: Yes.	
25	AUREA TORRES: Which would be sorry, I'm	



17

- 1 not good of math.
- 2 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are you willing to
- 3 accept the 25 percent?
- 4 AUREA TORRES: I would ask that it would be
- 5 reduced further.
- 6 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: You will have to wait in
- 7 line because this is the chance to come
- 8 forward --
- 9 AUREA TORRES: To accept the --
- 10 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: -- to accept the
- 11 25 percent.
- 12 AUREA TORRES: Okay. What is --
- MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT: \$350.00.
- 14 AUREA TORRES: Okay. No, I will wait.
- 15 I'll come back again.
- 16 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Anybody in line who is
- 17 not here to accept the arrangements that we have
- 18 proposed needs to get out of line and sit back
- 19 down.
- AUREA TORRES: And come back.
- 21 KEVIN ROGERS: I don't know how much owe.
- 22 I just got a letter.
- 23 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Well, are you willing to
- 24 accept the fine?
- 25 KEVIN ROGERS: Yes, yes.



- 1 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Come forward and state
- 2 your name and the cause number.
- 3 KEVIN ROGERS: Kevin Rogers, K-E-V-I-N,
- 4 R-O-G-E-R-S. Cause number 2017-6879-79.
- 5 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Just a minute --
- 6 KEVIN ROGERS: My campaign was Kevin Rogers
- 7 for State Senate.
- 8 MS. THOMPSON: Page 48. This is Kevin
- 9 Rogers for State Senate, cause number
- 10 2017-6879-79, has never been before the
- 11 commission before and has a civil penalty of
- 12 \$350.47.
- 13 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are you willing to
- 14 accept the 25 percent of that?
- 15 KEVIN ROGERS: Yes.
- 16 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Very well. You're free
- 17 to go. We'll send you an invoice for
- 18 25 percent.
- 19 KEVIN ROGERS: Thank you.
- 20 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Thank you.
- 21 RANDY HEAD: Hello, my name is Randy Head,
- 22 R-A-N-D-Y, H-E-A-D. Cause number 2017-6874-128.
- 23 MS. TAYLOR: It's on page 74. Mr. Chairman
- 24 and members of the commission, this is committee
- 25 to elect Randy Head attorney general. This is



- 1 his third time before the commission, and a
- 2 proposed civil penalty of \$50.47.
- 3 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are you willing to
- 4 accept 75 percent of that amount --
- 5 RANDY HEAD: Yes.
- 6 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: -- to resolve this
- 7 matter?
- 8 Very well. You're free to go.
- 9 RANDY HEAD: Thank you.
- 10 JOHN RUCKELSHAUS: Good afternoon. John
- 11 Ruckelshaus, R-U-C-K-E-L-S-H-A-U-S, cause number
- 12 2017-6828-132.
- MS. THOMPSON: Mr. Chairman, that's on page
- 14 76. Hoosiers for Ruckelshaus, cause number
- 15 2017-6828-132, has never been before the
- 16 commission before, has a civil penalty of
- 17 \$1,000.47.
- 18 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are you willing to
- 19 accept the arrangement to pay 25 percent of that
- 20 amount?
- JOHN RUCKELSHAUS: Yes.
- 22 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Very well. You're free
- 23 to go.
- JOHN RUCKELSHAUS: Thank you.
- GREG TAYLOR: Greg Taylor, T-A-Y-L-O-R,



- 1 last name. Cause number 2017-5688-142. And for
- 2 summary cause 2017-5688-143. Two separate ones.
- 3 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Okay.
- 4 MS. THOMPSON: Page 82 and page 83. This
- 5 is Greg Taylor from State Senate Committee,
- 6 cause number 2017-8688-142, and 143. He has
- 7 one, two, three -- this is his fourth before the
- 8 commission.
- 9 GREG TAYLOR: Is it?
- 10 MS. THOMPSON: Yeah, you had a couple back
- 11 in 2008 and 2012.
- He has a civil penalty on one of \$1,000.47
- 13 and on the other one is \$1,000.47.
- 14 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Based on our
- 15 arrangements, there is no opportunity for a
- 16 reduction. Are you willing to accept the full
- 17 amount of the fine?
- 18 GREG TAYLOR: Before I answer that, can I
- 19 ask one question?
- 20 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Okay.
- 21 GREG TAYLOR: It was the same report, but I
- 22 got two different -- it was because it was two
- 23 different donations is that why it's two
- 24 different cause numbers? It's on the same
- 25 report.



- 1 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Ask the staff to explain
- 2 that to us.
- MS. THOMPSON: Mr. Chairman, this was a
- 4 large contribution. He had two separate large
- 5 contributions. One was due on 11/7/2016 and --
- 6 they were both due on 11/7/2016 from two
- 7 different contributions.
- 8 GREG TAYLOR: But it's on the same filing
- 9 for the same period of time. I've never --
- 10 MS. TAYLOR: Each large contribution
- 11 requires a separate CFA11 large contribution
- 12 report.
- 13 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Okay. We're in the mode
- 14 now of accepting deals and I don't see the
- 15 eligibility. So, I guess, you could come back
- 16 and talk about it when it's your turn or accept
- 17 your full amount of that.
- MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: He --
- 19 COURT REPORTER: I'm sorry, what?
- 20 MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: My question was,
- 21 eligibility was contingent upon what?
- 22 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: The procedures allow for
- 23 a reduction of the fine without a hearing if
- 24 there is first, second, or third offenses. We
- 25 don't have any eligibility for waiving the



- 1 hearing for a fourth offense.
- 2 MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT: Right. Just so
- 3 you understand. You can come back -- this is
- 4 for people who are automatically, kind of,
- 5 basically entering a settlement agreement with
- 6 the counties. But people who don't want to do
- 7 that, at the end of these, there's a hearing
- 8 opportunity.
- 9 GREG TAYLOR: Okay. So this would count as
- 10 two separate violations?
- 11 MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT: Yes.
- 12 GREG TAYLOR: So this would be three and
- 13 four; am I right?
- MS. THOMPSON: Four and five.
- 15 GREG TAYLOR: Four and five?
- MS. THOMPSON: Correct.
- 17 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: So are you accepting the
- 18 fine?
- 19 GREG TAYLOR: I mean, yeah. I quess, I --
- MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: Well, you can --
- 21 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: You could wait and come
- 22 back --
- 23 GREG TAYLOR: All right. I'll wait and
- 24 come back.
- 25 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Is there anyone else who



- 1 has more than three violations to address? If
- 2 not, next please.
- 3 SCOTT WILLIS: Scott Willis, cause number
- 4 2017-6755-58.
- 5 MS. TAYLOR: On page 38. This is Friends
- 6 for Scott Willis. Cause number 2017-6755-58.
- 7 It's the first violation and a proposed civil
- 8 penalty of \$1,000.47.
- 9 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are you accepting the
- 10 25 percent?
- 11 SCOTT WILLIS: Yes, sir.
- 12 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Very well. Thank you.
- 13 You're free to go.
- 14 ANDY TALARZYK: Hi, Andy Talarzyk, number
- 15 2017-6592-48.
- 16 COURT REPORTER: Can you spell your name?
- 17 ANDY TALARZYK: T-A-L-A-R-Z-Y-K.
- 18 MS. THOMPSON: Mr. Chairman, it's on page
- 19 32. This is Committee to Elect Andy Talarzyk,
- 20 cause number 2017-6592-48, has never been before
- 21 the commission before, has a civil penalty of
- 22 \$1,000.47.
- 23 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: And are you willing to
- 24 accept the 25 percent fine?
- 25 ANDY TALARZYK: Sure.



- 24 1 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Very well. Thank you 2 very much. 3 ANDY TALARZYK: Thank you. DANIEL DOUGLASS: My name is Daniel 5 Douglass, D-A-N-I-E-L, D-O-U-G-L-A-S-S. here on behalf of the Committee to Elect Rose 6 7 Ryan. I have --CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Do you have a cause 9 number? 10 DANIEL DOUGLASS: My cause numbers are 11 2017-6819-140. The other one is 2017-6819-66. 12 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Give us a minute to look 13 that up. 14 DANIEL DOUGLASS: I also have the paper 15 here allowing me to speak on behalf of the 16 Committee to Elect Rose Ryan. 17 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Okay. Very good. 18 don't you hand that paper to me for the record? 19 This is a letter to whom it may concern, 20 authorizing Daniel Douglass to appear on behalf 21 of Rose Ryan, dated August 18, 2017; is that --22 DANIEL DOUGLASS: Yes.

 - 23 MS. THOMPSON: What's the other cause
 - 24 number? I have 140.
 - 25 DANIEL DOUGLASS: 66.



- 1 MS. THOMPSON: Thank you.
- 2 Mr. Chairman, one is on page -- at the
- 3 bottom of page 80. And the other one is on page
- 4 66. It's Committee to Elect Rose Ryan -- excuse
- 5 me, 41. Cause number 2017-6819-66, and
- 6 2017-6819-140. This committee has never been
- 7 before the commission before, has a civil
- 8 penalty of \$300.47 cents and \$1,000.47.
- 9 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are you willing to
- 10 accept the 25 percent penalty?
- 11 DANIEL DOUGLASS: Yes.
- 12 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Very well. You're free
- 13 to go.
- 14 DANIEL DOUGLASS: Thank you.
- 15 Also, I would like to check to make sure we
- 16 have the proper address. On the paper it has
- 17 the 224 East Canal Street. Our address has
- 18 changed. Is that something I need to do at a
- 19 later time?
- 20 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: You need to file an
- 21 amended statement of organization with the
- 22 Michelle.
- DANIEL DOUGLASS: Can I do that today?
- MS. THOMPSON: We have the Canal Street
- 25 address.



- 1 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Yes.
- MS. THOMPSON: So yes, you will need to
- 3 change that.
- 4 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Next.
- 5 REBECCA PHIPPS: Hello. I'm Rebecca
- 6 Phipps, R-E-B-E-C-C-A, P-H-I-P-P-S. I'm here
- 7 about cause number 2017-6868-76.
- 8 MS. THOMPSON: Mr. Chairman, that's on page
- 9 46.
- 10 REBECCA PHIPPS: And I have a letter
- 11 authorizing me to speak on behalf of the Oshman
- 12 Campaign.
- 13 COURT REPORTER: Speak for the what?
- 14 REBECCA PHIPPS: Oshman, O-S-H-M-A-N
- 15 Campaign.
- 16 MS. THOMPSON: This is cause number
- 17 2017-6868-76, has a civil penalty of \$350.47
- 18 cents.
- 19 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: I have a letter from
- 20 Stephen Oshman, Campaign Chair, July 19, 2017,
- 21 authorizing Rebecca --
- 22 REBECCA PHIPPS: Phipps.
- 23 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: -- Phipps to represent
- 24 the campaign today.
- 25 Hand that exhibit over to Mr. King.



- 1 Are you willing to accept the 25 percent 2 fine?
- 3 REBECCA PHIPPS: Yes, sir.
- 4 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Very well, you're free
- 5 to go.
- 6 REBECCA PHIPPS: Thank you.
- 7 PHILIP BENNETT: Hi. I'm Philip Bennett,
- 8 that's P-H-I-L-I-P, B-E-N-N-E-T-T. And my cause
- 9 number is 2017-6857-71.
- MS. THOMPSON: Mr. Chairman, that's on page
- 11 43, cause number 2017-6857-71, has been
- 12 before -- has been before the commission one
- 13 other time -- nope. Okay, has been before the
- 14 commission one other time, has a civil penalty
- 15 of \$1,000.47.
- 16 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Is that accurate?
- 17 PHILIP BENNETT: I've never been here
- 18 before.
- MS. THOMPSON: In 2016 pre-primary was --
- 20 on the past --
- 21 PHILIP BENNETT: Okay.
- MS. THOMPSON: Was late.
- 23 PHILIP BENNETT: Got it. So there's two --
- MS. THOMPSON: So you've been here one
- other time. Yeah, so this is your second.





- 1 afford.
- 2 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Okay. Next.
- 3 DALE NOWLIN: Sorry.
- 4 LACY HOLLINGS: Lacy Hollings, L-A-C-Y,
- 5 H-O-L-L-I-N-G-S. And I'm here on cause number
- 6 2017-6780-144.
- 7 MS. THOMPSON: That's on page 83. It's
- 8 cause number 2017-6780-144. Has not been before
- 9 the commission before, has a civil penalty of
- 10 \$1,000.47.
- 11 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are you willing to
- 12 accept the 25 percent?
- 13 LACY HOLLINGS: Yes.
- 14 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Very well, you're free
- 15 to go.
- 16 LACY HOLLINGS: Thank you.
- 17 GRAHAM FISHELL: Graham Fishell,
- 18 G-R-A-H-A-M, last name Fishell, F-I-S-H-E-L-L.
- 19 Here on behalf of Committee to Elect Joe
- 20 Taylor III, cause number 2017-6794-137.
- MS. THOMPSON: It's on page 79. Cause
- 22 number 2017-6794-137, and 138. Has a civil
- 23 penalty of \$1,000.47 on both, and this is his
- 24 first time before the commission.
- 25 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are you willing to



- 1 accept the 25 percent penalty for both?
- 2 GRAHAM FISHELL: Yes.
- CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Very well. Thank you.
- 4 GRAHAM FISHELL: I'm here for two other
- 5 people, do you want me to go to the back of the
- 6 line or --
- 7 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Go ahead.
- 8 GRAHAM FISHELL: Okay. I got a Citizens
- 9 for Mara Candelaria Reardon, 2017-5378-100.
- 10 MS. THOMPSON: Mr. Chairman, that is on
- 11 page 59, cause number 2017-5378-100, has been
- 12 before the commission one other time, has a
- 13 civil penalty of \$50.47. This is the second.
- 14 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are you willing to
- 15 accept the 50 percent?
- 16 GRAHAM FISHELL: Yes.
- 17 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Very good.
- 18 GRAHAM FISHELL: And the last one is
- 19 Citizens for Chuck Committee 2017-5575-134.
- 20 MS. THOMPSON: Page 77. Cause number
- 21 2017-5575-134. Has never been before the
- 22 commission before and has a civil penalty of
- 23 \$200.47.
- 24 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: There's a settlement
- 25 agreement on there?



- MS. THOMPSON: We don't have it on the
- 2 spreadsheet. So -- Mr. Chairman, there has not
- 3 been a settlement agreement on this one. We
- 4 just checked.
- 5 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Okay. Very well.
- 6 Are you willing to accept the 25 percent
- 7 penalty?
- 8 GRAHAM FISHELL: Yes.
- 9 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Thank you.
- 10 GRAHAM FISHELL: Thank you.
- 11 WILLIAM EHRET: Hello, William M. Ehret,
- 12 E-H-R-E-T. And I do not have the cause number.
- MS. THOMPSON: Last name was Ehret?
- 14 WILLIAM EHRET: Ehret, E-H-R-E-T. It was a
- 15 State Senate campaign and I don't know the
- 16 amount.
- 17 MEMBER NUSSMEYER: Do you recall the year
- 18 or which report?
- 19 WILLIAM EHRET: Yes, this past year. So it
- 20 would have been January.
- MS. THOMPSON: The annual report?
- 22 WILLIAM EHRET: Yes.
- MS. THOMPSON: Mr. Chairman, that's on page
- 24 39. Cause number 2017-6788-61, has never been
- 25 before the commission before, and has a civil



- 1 penalty of \$450.47.
- 2 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are you willing to
- 3 accept the 25 percent?
- 4 WILLIAM EHRET: Yes.
- 5 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Thank you very much.
- 6 WILLIAM EHRET: Uh-huh, thank you.
- 7 JEFF EMBRY: Jeff Embry, E-M-B-R-Y, cause
- 8 number 2017-6837-91.
- 9 MS. TAYLOR: It's on page 54. This is Jeff
- 10 Embry for State Representative of District 54.
- 11 Cause number 2017-6837-91. This is the first
- 12 time before the commission a proposed civil
- 13 penalty of \$700.47.
- 14 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are you willing to
- 15 accept the 25 percent penalty?
- 16 JEFF EMBRY: I have a question. I received
- 17 a letter from a Secretary of State Office the
- 18 1st of August 2016 that I have not filed the end
- 19 reports financial statements. I said, "Well, I
- 20 never did receive a financial manual." And on
- 21 August 17th I finally received the manual
- 22 August 17, 2016.
- 23 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: This is your opportunity
- 24 to accept the 25 percent discount -- or the
- 25 75 percent discount for a first time offense.



- 1 If you want to try the case and talk about it
- 2 some more, you'll have to go back and sit down
- 3 and come back up.
- 4 JEFF EMBRY: I'll take it.
- 5 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Okay. Thank you.
- 6 SHANE ZOELLNER: My name is Shane Zoellner,
- 7 S-H-A-N-E, Z-O-E-L-L-N-E-R. And my cause number
- 8 is 2017-6880-80.
- 9 MS. TAYLOR: On page 48, Mr. Chairman and
- 10 members of the commission, this is Friends of
- 11 Shane Zoellner, cause number 2017-6880-80. It's
- 12 the first time before the commission a proposed
- 13 civil penalty of \$50.47.
- 14 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are you willing to
- 15 accept the 25 percent penalty?
- 16 SHANE ZOELLNER: I am, yes.
- 17 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Thank you. You're free
- 18 to go.
- 19 SHANE ZOELLNER: I also am here with -- on
- 20 behalf of John Pickerill. I have a form here
- 21 that --
- 22 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Okay. A letter dated
- 23 August 18th, 2017, from John Pickerill,
- 24 authorizing Shane Zoellner to act as the
- 25 representative; is that correct?



- 1 SHANE ZOELLNER: Yes.
- 2 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: The cause number is on
- 3 here.
- 4 SHANE ZOELLNER: It's John Pickerill, so
- 5 J-O-H-N P-I-C-K-E-R-I-L-L.
- 6 MS. TAYLOR: On page 83 and top of 84,
- 7 Committee for Pickerill, cause number
- 8 2017-6827-145. It's first time before the
- 9 commission, a proposed civil penalty of \$200.45.
- 10 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: On behalf of Mr.
- 11 Pickerill are you accepting the 25 percent
- 12 penalty?
- 13 SHANE ZOELLNER: I am, yes.
- 14 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Very well.
- 15 SHANE ZOELLNER: That's all.
- 16 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Thank you.
- 17 SHANE ZOELLNER: Thank you very much.
- 18 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Yes, sir.
- 19 JAMES SHELTON: My name is James Shelton,
- 20 J-A-M-E-S, S-H-E-L-T-O-N, and cause number is
- 21 2017-6602-49.
- MS. THOMPSON: Mr. Chairman, it's on page
- 23 33. Cause number 2017-6602-49. This is his
- 24 second time before the commission, has a civil
- 25 penalty of \$300.47.



- 1 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are you willing --JAMES SHELTON: Who was financially liable 3 for this? Is it me or is it the committee? 4 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are you representing the 5 committee? Do you have a representation --6 JAMES SHELTON: Yes. Well, I'm the 7 chairman -- or the only person involved. Because I've disbanded the committee is why I'm 8 9 asking. 10 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: I think that would be a 11 legal conclusion that you would have to resolve 12 yourself. 13 JAMES SHELTON: Well, everything has been 14 addressed to this committee of, it's not to me 15 personally.
- 16 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Mr. King, can you
- 17 respond that question?
- 18 CO-DIRECTOR KING: Yeah. Mr. Chairman and
- 19 members of the commission, I'll -- and when I
- 20 finish up I'll ask Mr. Kochevar to add anything
- 21 to my analysis.
- The Indiana Court of Appeals has ruled that
- 23 when a committee is unable to pay any debt, that
- 24 the members of the committee, which include
- 25 chairman or treasurer are personally liable for



- 1 the committee's debt.
- 2 JAMES SHELTON: Okay.
- 3 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Mr. Kochevar, anything
- 4 to add?
- 5 MR. KOCHEVAR: I have nothing further to
- 6 add, Mr. Chairman.
- 7 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Thank you, Mr. King and
- 8 Mr. Kochevar.
- 9 Does that answer your question?
- JAMES SHELTON: Yep.
- 11 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Are you willing to
- 12 accept the --
- MS. TAYLOR: This is his second.
- 14 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: 50 percent -- 50 percent
- 15 --
- JAMES SHELTON: When did I have a first?
- MS. THOMPSON: In the 2016 pre-primary.
- MS. TAYLOR: You paid a settlement
- 19 agreement.
- JAMES SHELTON: How much was that?
- 21 MS. TAYLOR: \$50.00.
- 22 JAMES SHELTON: Oh, okay. I think I know
- 23 what you're talking about.
- Okay, yes, I'll take it.
- MS. TAYLOR: And I will add that your



- 1 committee is still open.
- 2 JAMES SHELTON: It is?
- MS. TAYLOR: Oh, nope, we missed the box.
- 4 It's closed. It's closed.
- 5 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Okay. 50 percent,
- 6 right?
- 7 JAMES SHELTON: Yep.
- 8 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Very good.
- 9 Anyone else that would like to accept the
- 10 arrangement?
- 11 Very well. The remaining committees will
- 12 be called to present evidence in these matters.
- 13 Before doing so, I want to note that in the past
- 14 the commission has followed certain procedures
- 15 for conducting campaign finance hearings, and I
- 16 move that the commission use the following
- 17 procedures today.
- 18 A. When each campaign finance matter is
- 19 called, the hearing will begin with recognizing
- 20 the campaign finance staff to provide
- 21 information about the documents in this matter
- 22 provided to commission members, including
- 23 letters from committees, and the notices given
- 24 to the campaign committee.
- B. Unless there is an objection, the



- 1 documents provided to the commission by the
- 2 Election Division will be entered into the
- 3 record at this meeting.
- 4 C. After campaign finance staff completes
- 5 presentation, a representative of the committee
- 6 will be recognized first and may present their
- 7 case for no more than five minutes.
- 8 D. Commission members may ask questions
- 9 during the presentation, but the time spent
- 10 answering these questions will not be counted
- 11 against the presenter's time. The Election
- 12 Division may signal the Chair when the
- 13 presenter's time is up. If the presenter offers
- 14 additional documents, or other physical evidence
- 15 not previously received by the commission, then
- 16 the original must be provided to the Election
- 17 Division to preserve for the record.
- 18 If the commission finds that a committee
- 19 has violated the campaign finance statutes,
- 20 state law requires a unanimous vote of all four
- 21 commissioners to waive or reduce the amount of
- 22 the penalty by state law.
- 23 If the commission makes a decision at this
- 24 meeting to either fine a committee, or dismiss
- 25 the case against the committee, then the



39 Election Division will prepare a final order for 1 2 the commission to approve at a later meeting. 3 If a committee is fined today, the committee will receive a notice from the 4 Election Division to date the fine after the 5 6 commission adopts the final order. 7 So it may be some time after today before a committee will be required to pay the fine. 9 The commission generally begins at the front of a room and asks those persons present 10 11 to come forward to have their matter heard. 12 is very helpful if you can speak up and say the 13 cause on your hearing material so the commission 14 and staff can quickly look it up on the 15 spreadsheet. 16 Remember to identify yourself when you 17 start speaking. Is there a second to this motion? 18 19 MEMBER KLUTZ: Second. 20 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Motion and a second. Any discussion? 21 22 Hearing none, all in favor say aye. 23 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: 24 MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: Aye.



25

Aye.

MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT:

- 1 MEMBER KLUTZ: Aye.
- 2 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: All opposed say nay.
- 3 Ayes have it, motion carries.
- 4 The commission will now proceed to open its
- 5 hearings on campaign finance enforcement action.
- 6 I have designated Stephanie Beckley to act
- 7 as my proxy for presiding over the hearing and
- 8 voting on these matters Associated General
- 9 Contractors of Indiana PAC, Pence Must Go
- 10 Political Action, PLS Corporation, Excess
- 11 Corporate Contribution.
- 12 At this time, I would ask that Stephanie
- 13 assume the chair.
- MS. BECKLEY: The first cause to be
- 15 considered concerns the Associated General
- 16 Contractors of Indiana PAC. Is there a
- 17 presenter to speak on behalf of this committee?
- 18 Anyone? In that case, I declare the
- 19 hearing on this matter closed.
- I ask commission members if there are any
- 21 further discussions or motions in this matter?
- MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: I have a question.
- 23 So if they haven't shown, does that mean that
- 24 they waived their hearing and the penalty just
- 25 gets imposed?



- 1 MEMBER KLUTZ: Yes, it's --
- 2 CO-DIRECTOR KING: Madame Chair, yeah, if I
- 3 could respond, and again, I'll yield to
- 4 Mr. Kochevar to add any additional information.
- Yes, the failure of a committee to appear
- 6 has been treated by the commission as default.
- 7 But it takes an affirmative vote from the
- 8 commission to impose the penalty. As a result
- 9 of that --
- 10 MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: Do we have the
- 11 papers for this one in here?
- MS. THOMPSON: We're looking for it.
- MS. TAYLOR: They paid settlement
- 14 agreement, they're not on the agenda.
- MS. BECKLEY: Okay. In that case --
- MS. THOMPSON: I think that was a past
- 17 settlement agreement that we --
- 18 MS. BECKLEY: So I will consider that
- 19 matter closed. Hearing no objections.
- 20 MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: So was it a past
- 21 settlement agreement or a --
- MS. TAYLOR: Past settlement agreement that
- 23 has already been approved by the commission.
- MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: Okay. So we don't
- 25 have to worry about it.



- 1 MS. BECKLEY: No problem. All right. Then
- 2 we will go to the Pence must Go PAC. Is there a
- 3 presenter to speak on behalf of this committee?
- 4 MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: Let me -- on the
- 5 other one, if we want to talk about our case --
- 6 MEMBER KLUTZ: Sir, will you please
- 7 identify yourself for the record?
- 8 RICK GILL: Yep, Rick Gill, R-I-C-K,
- 9 G-I-L-L. On the first one, is that the one we
- 10 get up and present our case?
- MS. BECKLEY: Yes -- are you here for the
- 12 Associated General Contractors --
- 13 RICK GILL: No.
- 14 MS. BECKLEY: Then we are going onto the
- 15 Pence Must Go PAC.
- 16 RICK GILL: Okay.
- MS. BECKLEY: Is there a presenter to speak
- 18 on behalf of Pence Must Go to the committee?
- 19 MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: Do we have the
- 20 materials --
- MS. THOMPSON: This one is on the
- 22 spreadsheet. It's on page 65, the top of 65.
- 23 MEMBER KLUTZ: I have a question for the
- 24 staff. Do we have confirmation that they were
- 25 properly served for this hearing?



- 1 MS. THOMPSON: Yes.
- 2 MEMBER KLUTZ: Can you describe for the
- 3 commission the proposed penalty?
- 4 MS. THOMPSON: This is cause number
- 5 2017-6696-110. It has a -- has never been
- 6 before the commission before, and has a civil
- 7 penalty of \$200.47.
- 8 MEMBER KLUTZ: Okay, I --
- 9 MS. BECKLEY: And I'd like to make one
- 10 final call, is there anyone here who would like
- 11 to present on behalf of the Pence Must Go plea?
- 12 All right.
- 13 MEMBER KLUTZ: Madam Chairman, based upon
- 14 confirmation that notice was given for this
- 15 hearing and no one is attending, I make a motion
- 16 that we assess the full proposed penalty of
- 17 \$200.47.
- 18 MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT: Second.
- 19 MS. BECKLEY: All right. All in favor say
- 20 aye.
- 21 MEMBER KLUTZ: Aye.
- MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT: Aye.
- MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: Aye.
- MS. BECKLEY: All opposed say nay.
- The ayes have it, and the motion to



- 1 ratify -- is adopted.
- 2 I'm sorry. To impose the penalty is
- 3 adopted.
- I believe that's all. I'll yield the chair
- 5 -- okay. And then -- okay, is there a presenter
- 6 to speak on behalf of PLS Corporation?
- 7 MATTHEW SWENTKOFSKE: Yes.
- 8 MS. BECKLEY: All right. Please come
- 9 before the committee.
- 10 MATTHEW SWENTKOFSKE: Hi, Matthew
- 11 Swentkofske, S-W-E-N-T-K-O-F-S-K-E. Thank you
- 12 very much for your time, commissioners --
- 13 MEMBER KLUTZ: Sir, we're going to ask the
- 14 staff to --
- 15 MATTHEW SWENTKOFSKE: Sure.
- 16 MS. THOMPSON: Mr. Chairman and members of
- 17 the commission, it's here on blue tab. Blue tab
- 18 in the back. It's the top PLS Financial
- 19 Services, cause number 2017-149 contributed to
- 20 the Mike Pence for Indiana in the amount of
- \$5,906.50, never been before the commission
- 22 before, and the Mike Pence for Indiana Committee
- 23 has refunded PSL the \$906.50. The proposed
- 24 civil penalty is three times the excess amount.
- 25 MEMBER KLUTZ: Three times -- would the --



1 MS. THOMPSON: That would be the 2,000 --MEMBER KLUTZ: That's the --3 MS. THOMPSON: Yeah, that's the -- three times. 5 MATTHEW SWENTKOFSKE: Commissioners, thanks 6 for allowing me to speak. I'll just give you a 7 quick background on this. Obviously, we -- the committee, PLS, presented the committee a check 9 for \$5,000.00, what happened was we then had an 10 contribution that put us over the limit. 11 believe within a week to ten days, we rectified 12 it with the campaign, they paid us back as was 13 noted. And so we caught it very quickly before 14 the reporting period was over. And the overage 15 was repaid to PLS. We have addressed that, and 16 put -- in place to not have that happen again. 17 And I just want to re-emphasize it is our first offense, and that we obviously will accept 18 whatever the commissioners recommend. 19 20 MEMBER KLUTZ: If I could ask a question. 21 MATTHEW SWENTKOFSKE: Sure. 22 MEMBER KLUTZ: The return contribution, was 23 that made prior to the notice by our --24 MATTHEW SWENTKOFSKE: Yes, yes --25 MEMBER KLUTZ: -- staff --



1 MATTHEW SWENTKOFSKE: -- I believe the event happened around November of 2015, I 3 believe, and the check was caught within about three weeks. So it was before any notice from the division. 6 MEMBER KLUTZ: And PLS Financial has taken steps to monitor and track this --8 MATTHEW SWENTKOFSKE: 9 MEMBER KLUTZ: Commission members, my 10 recollection in past events similar to this, 11 that in the event that this is a first time over 12 contribution and where the contribution is 13 returned prior to notice from our office and there's evidence that steps have been taken to 14 15 ensure this doesn't happen, this board in the past has waived penalties. And I would make a 16 17 motion that we would do so. 18 MS. BECKLEY: Do we have a second motion? I'll make a second motion. All in favor 19 20 say aye --21

discussions.

MS. BECKLEY:

MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT:

22

23

24

25

MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT: Wait, wait --

I'm sorry.

MS. BECKLEY: I'm sorry, discussions.

-- we have

- 1 apologies.
- 2 MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT: Can staff confirm
- 3 that that actually has been what we've done in
- 4 the past?
- 5 MS. THOMPSON: I believe -- well, I believe
- 6 that's what we've done in the past.
- 7 MS. TAYLOR: It's either been a waiver or a
- 8 10 -- reduced to 10 percent.
- 9 MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT: I was going to
- 10 say, I don't think we necessarily waive it.
- MS. TAYLOR: Depends on the day.
- 12 MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT: Yeah.
- 13 MEMBER KLUTZ: I think this is a situation
- 14 that the gap in time is fairly narrow when the
- 15 contribution was returned. That's the factor I
- 16 was taking into consideration.
- MS. BECKLEY: Is there any further
- 18 discussion on the motion?
- 19 In that case we will vote on the motion to
- 20 remove all penalty. All in favor say aye?
- 21 MEMBER KLUTZ: Aye.
- MEMBER WILSON OVERHOLT: Aye.
- MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: Aye.
- MS. BECKLEY: All opposed say nay.
- 25 Motion carried.



- 1 MATTHEW SWENTKOFSKE: Thank you very much.
- 2 MS. BECKLEY: I believe that is all I'm
- 3 called upon. So I will now yield the chair back
- 4 to Chairman Bennett.
- 5 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Okay. We're going to
- 6 start in the front row and work our way to the
- 7 back. The next person in the front row on the
- 8 left side, come forward.
- 9 BRENNA MCDONALD: Hi. I'm Brenna McDonald,
- 10 B-R-E-N-N-A, M-C-D-O-N-A-L-D. I am here on
- 11 behalf of the Indiana Psychologist PAC. I'm a
- 12 licensed clinical psychologist in Indiana and
- 13 also the treasurer of the PAC.
- MS. THOMPSON: Could you speak up a little
- 15 bit?
- BRENNA MCDONALD: Sure, sorry.
- 17 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Let us make sure we get
- 18 to the right --
- MS. THOMPSON: Cause number?
- BRENNA MCDONALD: Yeah, it's 2017-1543-9.
- MS. THOMPSON: Mr. Chairman, on page 11.
- 22 Indiana Psychology Political Action Committee,
- 23 cause number 2017-1543-9. Has been before the
- 24 commission four -- at least four times before,
- 25 has a civil penalty of \$150.47.



- 1 MEMBER KLUTZ: Let me ask a question. Four
- 2 times before, and then does that include this
- 3 settlement agreement as well? Or is this
- 4 settlement agreement in addition to that?
- 5 MS. TAYLOR: Settlement agreements are
- 6 included. It's been more than four times. We
- 7 don't have an exact number.
- 8 MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: Okay. So if it
- 9 says three times on the spreadsheet; is that
- 10 incorrect? Or is --
- 11 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Today would be the
- 12 fourth; is that correct?
- 13 MS. TAYLOR: Three times before the board
- 14 and three settlement agreements. So this is at
- 15 least a seventh time before the commission.
- MS. CELESTINO-HORSEMAN: Okay.
- MS. THOMPSON: Our spreadsheet, we just
- 18 take it by four.
- 19 CHAIRMAN BENNETT: Well, what do you have
- 20 to say?
- 21 BRENNA MCDONALD: I -- thank you for your
- 22 time. So the first I learned of about it, I
- 23 took over as treasurer of the PAC in 2015. All
- 24 of those occurrences were before then.
- 25 Actually, the first I learned of those

